



Rewarding Learning

**ADVANCED SUBSIDIARY (AS)
General Certificate of Education
2022**

Religious Studies

Assessment Unit AS 7

assessing

Foundations of Ethics with Special Reference to
Issues in Medical Ethics

[SRE71]

WEDNESDAY 8 JUNE, MORNING

**MARK
SCHEME**

General Marking Instructions

Introduction

The main purpose of a mark scheme is to ensure that examinations are marked accurately, consistently and fairly. The mark scheme provides examiners with an indication of the nature and range of candidates' responses likely to be worthy of credit. It also sets out the criteria which they should apply in allocating marks to candidates' responses.

Assessment objectives

Below are the assessment objectives for **GCE Religious Studies**

Candidates should be able to:

- demonstrate knowledge and understanding of religion, including:
 - religious, philosophical and/or ethical thought and teaching;
 - influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies;
 - cause and significance of similarities and differences in belief, teaching and practice; and
 - approaches to the study of religion and belief (AO1); and
- analyse and evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief, including their significance, influence and study (AO2).

Quality of candidates' responses

In marking the examination papers, examiners should be looking for a quality of response reflecting the level of maturity which may reasonably be expected of a 17 or 18-year-old which is the age at which the majority of candidates sit their GCE examinations.

Flexibility in marking

Mark schemes are not intended to be totally prescriptive. No mark scheme can cover all the responses which candidates may produce. In the event of unanticipated answers, examiners are expected to use their professional judgement to assess the validity of answers. If an answer is particularly problematic, then examiners should seek the guidance of the Supervising Examiner.

Positive marking

Examiners are encouraged to be positive in their marking, giving appropriate credit for what candidates know, understand and can do rather than penalising candidates for errors or omissions. Examiners should make use of the whole of the available mark range for any particular question and be prepared to award full marks for a response which is as good as might reasonably be expected of a 17 or 18-year-old GCE candidate.

Awarding zero marks

Marks should only be awarded for valid responses and no marks should be awarded for an answer which is completely incorrect or inappropriate.

Mark schemes for tasks or questions which require candidates to respond in extended written form are marked on the basis of levels of response which take account of the quality of written communication.

Levels of response

In deciding which level of response to award, examiners should look for the 'best fit' bearing in mind that weakness in one area may be compensated for by strength in another. In deciding which mark within a particular level to award to any response, examiners are expected to use their professional judgement. The following guidance is provided to assist examiners.

- **Threshold performance:** Response which just merits inclusion in the level and should be awarded a mark at or near the bottom of the range.
- **Intermediate performance:** Response which clearly merits inclusion in the level and should be awarded a mark at or near the middle of the range.
- **High performance:** Response which fully satisfies the level description and should be awarded a mark at or near the top of the range.

Each of the two assessment objectives have been categorised into five levels of performance relating to the respective abilities of the candidates. Having identified, for each assessment objective, the band in which the candidate has performed, the examiner should then decide on the appropriate mark within the range for the band.

Other Aspects of Human Experience at AS Level

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience, when required, to access Bands 3–5.

Synoptic Assessment at A2 Level

Candidates must support their answer with reference to at least one other unit of study to access Bands 4–5.

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience in their AO2 response to access Bands 3–5.

Quality of written communication

Quality of written communication is taken into account in assessing candidates' responses to all tasks and questions that require them to respond in extended written form. These tasks and questions are marked on the basis of levels of response. The description for each level of response includes reference to the quality of written communication.

For conciseness, quality of written communication is distinguished within levels of response as follows:

- Level 1: Quality of written communication is basic.
- Level 2: Quality of written communication is limited.
- Level 3: Quality of written communication is good.
- Level 4: Quality of written communication is very good.
- Level 5: Quality of written communication is excellent.

In interpreting these level descriptions, examiners should refer to the more detailed guidance provided below:

Level 1 (Basic): The candidate makes only a basic selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. The organisation of material lacks clarity and coherence. There is little or no use of specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are basic and the intended meaning is not clear.

Level 2 (Limited): The candidate makes a limited selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. The organisation of material may lack clarity and coherence. There is limited use of specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar may be such that intended meaning is not clear.

Level 3 (Good): The candidate makes a reasonable selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with some clarity and coherence. There is good use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are sufficiently competent to make meaning clear.

Level 4 (Very Good): The candidate makes a very good selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with clarity and coherence. There is very good use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are of a very good standard to make meaning clear.

Level 5 (Excellent): The candidate successfully selects and uses the most appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with a high degree of clarity and coherence. There is widespread and accurate use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are of a sufficiently high standard to make meaning clear.

COVID-19 Context

Given the unprecedented circumstances presented by the COVID-19 public health crisis, senior examiners, under the instruction of CCEA awarding organisation, are required to train assistant examiners to apply the mark scheme in case of disrupted learning and lost teaching time. The interpretation and intended application of the mark scheme for this examination series will be communicated through the standardising meeting by the Chief or Principal Examiner and will be monitored through the supervision period. This paragraph will apply to examination series in 2021–2022 only.

Band	AO1 Performance Descriptors	Marks
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An excellent response to the question asked • Demonstrates comprehensive understanding and knowledge • Demonstrates a comprehensive understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A very high degree of relevant evidence and examples • A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure • An extensive range of technical language and vocabulary with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[21]–[25]
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A very good response to the question asked • Demonstrates a high degree of understanding and almost totally accurate knowledge • Demonstrates a high degree of understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A very good range of relevant evidence and examples • A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure • A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[16]–[20]
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A good response to the question asked • Demonstrates a reasonable degree of understanding and mainly accurate knowledge • Demonstrates a reasonable degree of understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A good range of relevant evidence and examples • A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence • A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[11]–[15]
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited response to the question asked • Demonstrates limited knowledge and understanding • Demonstrates limited understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A limited range of evidence and/or examples • A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence • A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[6]–[10]
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A basic response to the question asked • Demonstrates minimal knowledge and understanding • Demonstrates minimal understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • Little, if any, use of evidence and/or examples • A basic answer with basic structure and coherence • A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[0]–[5]

Band	AO2 Performance Descriptors	Marks
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A comprehensive and coherent response demonstrating an excellent attempt at critical analysis • An excellent attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • An excellent attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which are set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience • An excellent attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure • An extensive range of technical language and terminology with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[21]–[25]
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A very good response demonstrating a very good attempt at critical analysis • A very good attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A very good attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which are set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience • A very good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure • A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[16]–[20]
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A reasonable response demonstrating a good attempt at critical analysis • A good attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A good attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which are set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience • A good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence • A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[11]–[15]
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited response demonstrating a modest attempt at critical analysis • A limited attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A limited attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which struggle to relate, where necessary, to other aspects of human experience • A limited attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence • A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[6]–[10]

Band	AO2 Performance Descriptors	Marks
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A basic response demonstrating little attempt at critical analysis • A basic attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A basic attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which fail to relate, where necessary, to other aspects of human experience • A basic attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A basic answer with basic structure and coherence • A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[0]–[5]

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience, where necessary, to access Bands 3–5.

Section A

AVAILABLE
MARKS

Answer **one** question from this section

- 1 (a) Describe the contribution of Joseph Fletcher to Situation Ethics with particular reference to his views on rules in moral decision making.

Answers may include:

- The publication of Fletcher's work in the twentieth century, "Situation Ethics" (1966), which outlined his thinking and was to prove seminal in the development of Christian ethics.
- Fletcher's rejection of legalistic and antinomian approaches with the former seen as harsh and prescriptive and the latter as leading to the abandonment of rules.
- Situation Ethics as a simpler and less complicated alternative to legalism, the seeking of a middle way in which the only moral absolute is the command to love your neighbour as yourself.
- The influence of the teaching and example of Jesus and Paul, the importance given to the primacy of love, the type of love envisaged – agape.
- Fletcher's view that while moral rules/laws and moral traditions may offer guidance, we cannot know for certain in advance what love will require of us in a given situation, how rules are secondary to love.
- The fundamental contextual and situational character of morality.
- How the Christian is called to emulate the example of Jesus in the application of agape.
- How moral rules are secondary to human need, love's need as paramount.
- Reference to case studies used by Fletcher to illustrate his views, e.g. that of Mrs Bergmeier.
- The four working principles enunciated by Fletcher – Pragmatism, Relativism, Positivism, Personalism.
- Fletcher's fundamental principles, e.g. the ruling norm of Christian decision is love, nothing else.
- The influence of Existentialism in the development of the theory.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

(b) "Situation Ethics is not a Christian approach to morality as it is essentially utilitarian and relativistic in character." Assess the truth of this statement. Justify your answer.

Answers may include:

- How Situation Ethics appears to be a form of Christian utilitarianism in its insistence on maximising love, akin to maximising happiness in utilitarianism.
- How Situation Ethics is seen to have a relativistic character in that any moral action need not be intrinsically right or wrong and how the end could justify the means.
- How Situation Ethics, while it rejects antinomianism, could itself be guilty of antinomianism.
- How Situation Ethics could condone acts such as mercy killing or adultery which are seen by other Christians as reprehensible.
- The condemnatory views of the Roman Catholic Church which sees Situation Ethics as only serving to compromise justice.
- The views of other conservative Christians who have difficulty with its contextual character and undermining of biblical absolutes.
- The continued relevance for the retention of clear moral absolutes in moral decision making.
- How a teleological approach like Situation Ethics can have an absolutist character in its insistence on the application of the agape principle.
- Situation Ethics as a theological ethic rather than a teleological ethic.
- How Fletcher did not countenance antinomianism.
- Situation Ethics as a version of Act Utilitarianism.
- Situation Ethics as a truly Christian ethic as it is overtly faithful to the teaching and example of Jesus, as Jesus rejected legalism so does the situationalist – how the Christian is called to emulate Jesus.
- How some see Natural Moral Law as a truly Christian approach as it is a duty-based approach asserting the importance of moral absolutes.
- How for others, biblical ethics is the only true approach to moral decision making.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO2)

[25]

50

AVAILABLE
MARKS

- 2 (a) With particular reference to the passive/active distinction, summarise the main reasons why euthanasia is controversial.

AVAILABLE
MARKS

Answers may include:

- Specific consideration of reasons why euthanasia might be controversial with particular reference to issues surrounding the passive/active distinction.
- The desire to avoid unnecessary pain and suffering, the right to a dignified death.
- The principle – freedom to live, freedom to die.
- The autonomy of the dying person and respect for that person.
- The argument for voluntary euthanasia as against involuntary and non-voluntary euthanasia.
- The view of the sacredness of human life, God as the author of life and death.
- The spiritual value of suffering as in the Christian view of suffering and death.
- The prohibition on killing in the Commandments.
- The controversy around the direct involvement of another to bring about premature death.
- The availability of Hospice care, the demand for greater palliative care.
- Specific reference to issues surrounding the passive/active distinction.
- How the passive/active distinction has widespread acceptance within religious and non-religious groups.
- How the principle is underpinned by the Acts/Omissions Doctrine.
- How for some if passive euthanasia is accepted, why not active euthanasia as the end result in both cases is the same.
- How, based on the Acts/Omissions Doctrine there is a difference between an act and an omission and therefore, there is a difference between passive and active euthanasia.
- How for some moral philosophers there is no logical difference and hence, no moral difference between an act and an omission if the end result is the same; possible reference to the Smith/Jones analogy.
- The dangers of misuse, the slippery slope argument.
- The argument for assisted dying rather than assisted suicide.
- Consideration of the diversity of viewpoints across religious and secular thinking.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

- (b) "A human being is a person from the moment of conception until death."
Assess this claim. Justify your answer.

AVAILABLE
MARKS

Answers may include:

- Specific consideration of the personhood debate in relation to life and death issues.
- The range of argument, e.g. that it is axiomatic or earned, religious views (that it is automatic) to non-religious views (with some seeing personhood as having no ontological existence), from the conservative to more permissive views.
- Religious views, e.g. each and every person made in God's image, how biblical teaching is used to underpin this, the view that personhood is conferred at the moment of conception, how there is widespread agreement amongst Christians here, how a human life must be treated with respect from the moment of conception until death, the right to life from conception to death, the implications of this thinking for the understanding of the morality of abortion and euthanasia, how for the Roman Catholic Church abortion and euthanasia are fundamentally wrong as they contravene the inviolable right to life from conception to death, how some Christians might not share this view as they could see the embryo as a potential person rather than an actual person (and so might countenance abortion in certain circumstances) and/or might not see an individual who is comatose as a person and could be accepting of the act of mercy killing.
- Possible reference to the early views of Aquinas on ensoulment, the views of Calvin suggesting the immediacy of personhood.
- Non-religious views, e.g. the impugning of the religious understanding of human life as God given, how human life may be special but not necessarily sacred, how there is a difference between being a member of the species homosapien and being considered a person, the distinction between potential person and actual person, how some don't see personhood as an entitlement until birth, how some think that the conferring of personhood is dependant on certain criteria (e.g. consciousness and rationality) and therefore even an infant might not be a person, the implications of this thinking for an understanding of the morality of abortion and euthanasia, how non-religious people would be more accepting of abortion and euthanasia.
- Particular views of personhood, e.g. Stott, Singer and Tooley.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO2)

[25]

50

Section B

**AVAILABLE
MARKS**

Answer **one** question from this section

- 3 (a)** For what reasons can Natural Moral Law be considered a deontological approach to moral decision making?

Answers may include:

- Clarification of the term deontological.
- Natural Moral Law as a duty-based approach in ethics.
- The interest in the moral action itself as against the consequences of the moral action, how the act is either intrinsically right or wrong.
- Natural Moral Law as a form of moral absolutism.
- The profile of the Primary Precepts in Natural Moral Law – to reproduce, to learn and educate children, self-preservation and preservation of the innocent, worship God and how these reinforce its deontological character.
- How these precepts are fundamental to this theory as they reveal the ultimate purpose of human life.
- How in the religious view these precepts are fundamental principles revealed by God.
- The importance of the place of human reason in Natural Moral Law in fulfilling the requirements of the Precepts.
- Possible reference to specific moral dilemmas to illustrate how the theory is deontological in character, e.g. abortion, euthanasia.
- Possible reference to the Doctrine of Double Effect and/or the Acts-Omissions Doctrine to illustrate the deontological character of the theory.
- The profile of Natural Moral Law within religious ethics especially Roman Catholicism.
- The distinction between efficient and final cause.
- The distinction between real and apparent goods.
- The distinction between interior and exterior acts.
- Origins in Greek philosophy with Aristotle, the contribution of Boethius and Aquinas in the development of the theory.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

(b) With reference to other aspects of human experience, evaluate the view that in a morally confused age, moral absolutes are still required. Justify your answer.

Answers may include:

- Consideration of the claim in relation to other aspects of human experience.
- Possible historical and/or contemporary exemplification.
- The value of moral absolutes in moral decision making as offering certainty and fixed yardsticks in a highly secular and pluralistic age.
- The need to counteract subjectivism in ethics and “the dictatorship of moral relativism”.
- How the end cannot justify the means, how there are certain moral actions which are either intrinsically right or wrong.
- Possible reference to the Categorical and Practical Imperatives in Kantian ethics.
- The impugning of moral absolutes in an age which is seen as overtly “godless”, an age which champions the individual as the supreme moral agent, an age which increasingly sees religious morality and biblical injunctions as irrelevant.
- The impact of the Enlightenment on human thinking.
- The legacy of the views of Friedrich Nietzsche.
- The thinking of Simone de Beauvoir – the ambiguity of ethics.
- The views of various writers, e.g. Peter Singer, Richard Dawkins, Stephen Fry, Christopher Hitchens, Sam Harris, Alain de Botton.
- Christians who could identify with contextualist approaches to ethics, e.g. Christian Virtue Ethicists.
- How moral absolutes need not necessarily be inflexible.
- The importance of love and compassion in moral decision making.
- The issue as to whether the current age is morally confused or not.
- The importance for many of morality being rooted in God and religion, the importance of Divine Commands in providing clear standards.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience to access Bands 3–5.

(AO2)

[25]

AVAILABLE
MARKS

50

- 4 (a) "In Vitro Fertilisation (IVF) has moral implications for Christians in the areas of marriage and family." Discuss this statement.

AVAILABLE
MARKS

Answers may include:

- How for the Christian the moral issues are many, not only the IVF technique itself but also its uses.
- Specific reference to the implications for marriage and family.
- Marriage – how IVF could involve intrusion into the marriage bond, 3rd party involvement and the possible taint of adultery, the undermining of the covenantal character of marriage, how the mystery and sacredness associated with human reproduction has moved from an intimate environment to that of a scientific laboratory, how procreation has moved from a God-designed process to a human technique, from that which is "begotten" to that which is "made", the creative activity of God replaced by a medical practitioner, the separation of the procreative and unitive purposes of the sexual act.
- Family – how if conjugal union and the marriage bond are undermined then so could the traditional concept of family be threatened especially if donation and surrogacy is involved.
- How Christians do not necessarily share an agreed position on these concerns, e.g. how in Roman Catholicism IVF is fundamentally immoral as it is contrary to Natural Moral Law, how it is viewed as "mechanical adultery", how the integrity of the embryo is seriously threatened whereas other more liberal Christians (e.g. Christian utilitarians/ situationalists) might take a very different view in that the end could justify the means, how the plight of infertility has to be overcome.
- How all Christians fundamentally understand a child to be a gift from God, the importance of the principle of the sanctity of human life and are concerned about the commodification of human life, the issue of spare embryos and the obsessiveness with fertility.
- The views of Canon Herbert Waddams (a traditionalist) – that couples should accept their inability to have children using the frustration of it to deepen themselves spiritually or adopt instead.
- Possible reference to the struggle of infertility and the strain this might place on a marriage.
- The role of conscience in the debate.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

- (b) With reference to other aspects of human experience, assess the claim that to assert the sovereignty of the individual in ethical matters undermines the place of God and religion. Justify your answer.

Answers may include:

- Consideration of the claim in relation to other aspects of human experience.
- Possible historical and/or contemporary exemplification.
- How some see the current age as overtly secular with religion having a waning influence, an age when the individual can assert their personal autonomy and freedom.
- How with the apparent decline of religion, especially in Europe, humankind has had to look elsewhere for guidance on ethical matters.
- The realisation that in a “godless age” it is important to ensure that moral anarchy does not ensue if the traditional underpinning is removed and so the consideration of other ethical systems/approaches that are free from religious influence, e.g. utilitarianism.
- How the record of religion historically has tarnished its standing in moral matters, e.g. the legacy of the slave trade, treatment of women, sex abuse scandals, suicide bombers.
- The views of various thinkers, e.g. Peter Singer, Richard Dawkins, Stephen Fry, Christopher Hitchens, Sam Harris.
- The dangers inherent in the assertion of the sovereignty of the individual in ethics, e.g. the promotion of the individualistic ethic at the expense of the community ethic, subjectivism in ethics and the denial of any fixed yardsticks in morality, the growth of totalitarianism and abuse of human rights.
- The importance for many of morality being rooted in God and religion, the importance of Divine Commands in providing clear standards, the need for humankind to be mindful of Divine judgement on how humans exercise their freedom in this earthly existence.
- How while some may have become disillusioned with institutionalised religion they have not given up on God.
- The profile of religion, especially Islam (a religion which is continuing to grow) and its influence on the moral life, how submission to the will of Allah is the pervading feature of this faith and is widely accepted by its adherents.
- Evidence from societies where religion was displaced leading, not to personal liberty, but a totalitarian nightmare, e.g. Stalinist Russia.
- The argument that to remove God and religion from ethics is to invite dilution of standards in public and private morality, the temptation to dethrone God and put in place the deification of humankind (apotheosis), the potential for the Pandora’s box scenario in ethics.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience to access Bands 3–5.

(AO2)

[25]

Total

**AVAILABLE
MARKS**

50

100